

## APPENDIX II

### THIS TRANSLATION AND ARBERRY'S COMPARED

Terms used in more than one recipe:

- ‘A while’: Arberry always translates *sā<sup>c</sup>a* as ‘hour’. In a very few recipes such as *Fustuqiyya* it does appear to mean an hour, and there I translate it as such. In every other case it means ‘a while’, a non-specific length of time which is often explained by a phrase beginning ‘until’. It is quite impossible for it to mean ‘an hour’ in, e.g., *nāranjiyya*, where meatballs are dipped in egg yolk and returned to the pot to cook ‘for a *ṣā<sup>c</sup>a*’, and the process is repeated three more times.
- ‘Mixed spices’: following Chelebi, Arberry misread *aṭrāf al-ṭīb* (‘sides of scent’) as *azfār al-ṭīb*, i.e. *blattes de Bysance*, the fragrant operculum of a certain marine snail. As other medieval cookbooks show, *aṭrāf al-ṭīb* meant mixed spices, the equivalent of modern Arab mixtures such as *ḥawāyij* and *bahārāt*.
- ‘Meatballs’: Arberry translated *kubab* and *kubāb* as ‘cabobs’. Since they are always made of ground meat and thrown into stew, and in the sweetmeats section they are a shape, ‘(meat)balls’ is a better translation.
- ‘To stew’: Arberry translated the verb *‘arraqa* literally as ‘to cause (something) to sweat’, understanding it to mean frying meat until it exudes its moisture. Sometimes *‘arraqa* does seem just a synonym for frying. In *aruzz mufalfal*, meat is first fried, then boiled, and after all the water evaporates it starts to sweat: that is, to fry in the rendered fat of the meat. However, ‘to sweat’ cannot be the culinary meaning of this word, because

sometimes meat is entirely covered with water and then ‘sweated’. For that matter, Arberry quoted Reinhardt Dozy’s observation that *‘arraqa* is applied to ‘cooking [dry figs] in water, with a view to preserving them’. Arberry translated this verb in various other ways as well: ‘to be juicy’, ‘to give off its juices’ and (often in Chapter III) ‘to fry lightly’.

One thing is clear about *‘arraqa*: it describes a preliminary or at most an intermediary step of cooking; never a final one. After the sweating, there is always another phase on the fire before the dish is done. The book’s introduction points out that sweating before boiling is characteristic of the dishes called *sawādhij* and *qalāyā*, and that it is a way of preventing the rise of a scum (of congealed blood) when the meat is later boiled. Perhaps this was the original sense of the verb – to ‘sweat away’ the potential scum. I have chosen to render *‘arraqa* as ‘to stew’; not a perfect translation, I am aware, but more idiomatic than ‘to sweat’.

‘Soy sauce’: *murrī* was made by rotting barley according to exact instructions which produce a liquid sauce that tastes quite like soy sauce; a recipe is given at the end of the book. Arberry left the word *murrī* untranslated, and he misunderstood the recipe because he read the rare word *fūdhaj* (‘rotted’) as a variant of *fūdhīnaj*, ‘pennyroyal’.

Arberry’s ‘beet’ is *silq*, ‘Swiss chard’. Arab cooks prefer to use the fleshy stalks, rather than the green leafy portion.

‘Sour’/‘bitter’: in *baṣaliyya* and *safarjaliyya*, Arberry translated *ḥāmiḍ/muḥammaḍa* ‘sour/soured’ as ‘bitter’. In fact, al-Baghdādī refers to bitterness only once: when olives are salted (in *zaitūn mubakhkhar*) to remove it. Oddly, Arberry translates this ‘until the sourness passes off’!

‘Quarter lengthwise’: fleshy vegetables like the eggplant were generally split lengthwise in four parts before cooking, using two cuts that, on end, form a cross (*ṣalīb*). *Ṣalīb* can also

mean ‘hard’ or ‘firm’, which led Arberry to translations like ‘splitting the eggplant thoroughly’.

‘Lean meat’: in Arabic, *lahm aḥmar* ‘red meat’ does not contrast with white meat, such as chicken, but with fat meat (*lahm samīn*).

‘Whole raw eggs’: *‘uyūn al-baid*, ‘eyes of eggs’, refers to eggs which are cooked with the yolks unbroken (so that they resemble eyes). Generally in this book they are cooked on the surface of a stew. Arberry translated this term as ‘poached eggs’.

‘Linen’: Arberry consistently read *kittān*, ‘linen’, as ‘cotton’.

‘Beat sweet almonds fine and pound to a liquid consistency with water’: Arberry generally translates this frequent instruction as ‘sweet almonds are chopped fine and moistened (or soaked) in water’. The nuts are pounded (*madqūq*), not chopped. Such instructions are intended to make a nut-based liquid for thickening a sauce; in effect, almond milk, though apparently without straining out the solid residue of the almonds.

‘Jujubes’ are often rendered as ‘raisins’, Arberry evidently reading *‘unnāb* ‘jujubes’ as *‘inab* ‘grapes’.

‘Sour grapes’: sweet grapes are not used in this book, only sour grapes (*hişrim*). Arberry translates this word sometimes as ‘grapes’, sometimes as ‘raisins’.

‘Celery leaves’: during the Middle Ages, only the leaves of the celery plant were eaten, hence instructions like ‘celery cut from its roots and stems’.

‘Date molasses’: Arberry’s ‘date-juice’ or ‘date-honey’ was *dibs*, a thick treacle or molasses of boiled down juice of dates (or other sweet things, such as grapes or carob).

The word *bāqāt* means ‘bundles, bunches’. When it refers to herbs, Arberry translated it as ‘sprigs’, rather plausibly. But ‘sprigs’ of spinach or chard is quite absurd, so I have translated this word as ‘bunches’, agnostic as to their size.

‘To milk (nuts) with water’ (*yustaḥlab*): in *nīrbāj* and *isfīdhabāja*, Arberry translated this ‘to stir in water’.

Arberry’s ‘beans’ are *bāqillā*, broad beans, known in America as fava beans. His ‘pulse’ is *māsh*, mung beans or Bengal gram.

Arberry translated both *‘ūd dārṣīnī* (a stick of Chinese cinnamon, viz. *Cinnamomum aromaticum*) and *‘īdān dārṣīnī* (sticks of cinnamon) as ‘cinnamon bark’.

‘Cloves of garlic’: several times in Chapter VII, Arberry translates *asnān thūm*, ‘cloves (literally, teeth) of garlic’, as ‘quarters of garlic’.

Arberry consistently read *nā‘ima* as ‘soft’, but in Chapter IX it has the sense of ‘smooth’ when applied to the smooth floor tile (‘soft surface’) used as a pastry marble and the head of the iron peg (‘iron stake with a soft head’) used for stretching candies.

In Chapters VIII and IX Arberry began to translate *dist*, which he had earlier rendered as ‘a copper bowl’ (in the recipe for *Bādhinjān Maḥsī* on page 87), as ‘dish’. From *Makshūfa* to the end of Chapter XI it becomes ‘a basin’.

### Introduction

‘The resurrector of mankind’: Arberry’s reading ‘he hath brought every creature to life’ is what we should expect an introduction to say, but the text has *munashshir al-anām*. Arberry may have read *mubshir*, associating it with a verb meaning ‘to bring forth vegetation’ (of the earth) or *bashar*, ‘human being’.

‘Who with His manifest blessings causes the plants to grow which encompass the land’: Arberry read *barriyya* (land, countryside) as *bariyya* (creation) and translated this ‘(He) has made herbs to grow; and He encompasseth all mankind with His manifold blessings’.

‘Those which a forbidden thing has not contaminated’: since the vowels were not written in the published Arabic text, Arberry read *lam yashubhu muḥarram* as *lam yushabbah muḥarram*, ‘that it be not doubtful or unlawful’ (literally, ‘that a proscribed thing not be doubtful’)

‘(It is not forbidden) to be meticulous about (food)’: here Arberry translated *ta’annuq* as ‘to take delight in’, but two sentences later he translated the same verb as ‘(which) he had prepared to the best of his ability’.

### Chapter I

**Al-Sikbāj.** ‘Its scum and froth’: ‘the froth and cream’, Arberry perhaps reading *zabaduhu* ‘its froth’ as *zubda* ‘butter’.

**Ibrāhīmiyya.** ‘galingale’: Arberry did not translate the word ‘ūd, perhaps because its more usual meaning ‘a stick’ suggested that it was a measure of ginger.

‘without boiling’: ‘without skinning’. (But the verb *salaqa* can indeed mean ‘to remove the skin by boiling’.)

**Jurjāniyya.** ‘carrots from which the woody interior has been removed, chopped medium’: ‘walnuts, first shelling and them chopping up into middling pieces’. Here the error is al-Baghdādī’s; the London MS corrected *jauz* ‘walnuts’ to *jazar* ‘carrots’.

‘pomegranates and black raisins in equal proportion (*niṣfain bil-sawā*)’: ‘pomegranates and black grapes cut in halves’.

**Dikabrika.** ‘mix with rose-water and vinegar’: Arberry omits ‘with’, as if these two liquids are merely mixed together, rather than with the ground almonds and other ingredients preceding.

**Nīrbāj.** ‘small or medium’: ‘middling pieces’.

‘If you like to put in carrots’: ‘and leeks if desired’.

‘a third as much of black raisins’: ‘a third the quantity’.

of the seeds of black grapes'. (The preceding ingredient is pomegranate seeds, which at most seasons of the year were a dried ingredient and had to be pounded, macerated and strained to be usable. Arberry took 'seeds' to refer to the grapes as well and the seeds themselves to be the ingredient, not the dried fruit around them; hence he translated 'pound' in the following instruction as 'grind'.)

'When the meat stews and the water decreases, sprinkle lean meat with spices': 'While the meat is stewing, and its juices are being given off, mince up red meat with seasonings'.

**Ṭabāhaja.** Arberry suggests that 'sliced meat' refers to slicing it from the bone, but the following instruction says to 'slice' tail fat. It seems the medieval practice was to cut meat into slices (*sharā'ih*) and then to cut them into smaller pieces.

**Ḥulwiyya.** 'carrots': 'leeks', again.

'small pieces of sweet prunes': Arberry read this ambiguously spelled passage as *qita<sup>c</sup> mubaḥthara wa ḥalwā al-qurāḍiyya* 'pieces of *mubaḥthara* and *qurāḍiyya*' (two pastries, one of them speculative), and he consequently read the name of the dish as *ḥalawiyya*, deriving it from *ḥalwā*. However, the text clearly spells the name *ḥulwiyya*, and I interpret the passage as *qita<sup>c</sup> yasīra (min) ḥulw al-qarāṣiyā*, which is in line with the London MS, *K. Wasf* and *ḥulwiyya* recipes in other books, all of which are sweetened with dried fruits.

**Rummāniyya.** 'take sour pomegranates, strip them by hand and squeeze them well': 'take sour pomegranates, squeeze very well in the hand'.

**Ribāsiyya.** 'rhubarb': 'redcurrants'. Perhaps Arberry was thinking of *Ribes*, the botanical name of the redcurrant.

**Līmūniyya:** *Līmūṭwiyya*.

**Mishmishiyya:** 'macerate by hand': 'wipe in the hands'.

**Nāranjiyya.** ‘Take safflower (seeds)’: ‘take cardamom-seeds’.  
Safflower (*qurṭum*) seeds were milked in water just like almonds and walnuts.

### Chapter II

**ʿAdasiyya.** The passage ‘When the chard is done, add the necessary amount of water. Then boil it’ was omitted by Arberry.

**Hintiyya.** ‘bruise it a little in the mortar’: *turadd yasīran* might also be read Arberry’s way, ‘crush it fine in the mortar’.

**Sugħdiyya.** ‘let them be hot so that the whites coat them and stick to them’: ‘let them be hot so as to absorb the whites and be covered by them’.

### Chapter III

**Al-ʿAnbariyya.** ‘macerate it by hand. Press out its juice’: ‘dry it by hand, squeezing out the water’.

‘dry it on a tray (*ṭabaq*)’: ‘serve dry in a dish’.

**Safarjaliyya.** ‘sour ripe quinces’: ‘ripe, bitter quince’.

**Mudaqqaqāt ḥāmiḍa.** This is another of the places where Arberry misread *ḥāmiḍa* ‘sour’ as ‘bitter’.

‘When it is done and casts off its fat’: ‘When cooked, remove the oils’.

**Būrān.** ‘beat them well with a ladle until they become like a pudding’: ‘beat well with a ladle, until it becomes like *kabīṣ*’. The consistency is of a flour-thickened pudding (*khabīṣ*), not the stew *kabīṣ*.

**Manbūsha.** ‘tendons and cartilage’: ‘veins and gristle’. Since there is no way to remove veins from meat, I interpret *ʿurūq* (‘roots, veins’) as tendons.

**Madfūna.** ‘remove all that fills its interior’: Arberry read *bizrihi*, ‘its seeds’, but the text explicitly spells this word *bazrihi*, ‘that which fills it’.

**Būrāniyyat al-Qarʿ.** ‘onions in proportion to the meat’: ‘onion

as required’.

**Ruṭabiyya.** Perhaps Arberry read *gharīq(an)* as *‘arīq*, ‘deeply rooted; noble’, to arrive at his translation ‘take sugarcandy dates, or Medina dates’. This reading is made less plausible by the fact that in al-Baghdādī’s text the adjective is in the accusative case, which implies that it specifies a condition (‘when they are drowned’), rather than the name of a variety of date.

**Khashkhāshiyya.** ‘Sprinkle it with half a *dirham* of salt’: ‘drop in half a *dirham*’, omitting the salt.

**‘Unnābiyya.** Again I translate *‘urūq* as tendons, not veins.

#### Chapter IV

**Harīsa.** ‘Then beat it again’: ‘then stir again’.

**Akārī<sup>c</sup>.** ‘Take the trotters from a year-old lamb’: ‘Take a yearling lamb’. Because the instruction *al-akārī<sup>c</sup> tuttakhad min ḥamal ḥaulī* appears after the title **Akārī<sup>c</sup>**, Arberry assumed it was a dittography, and as a result he put the whole lamb in the pot.

#### Chapter V

**Muṭajjan.** ‘Take a suckling kid and scald it’: ‘Take suckling kid, skin’.

‘Dry it after boiling’: ‘After scalding, dry’.

**Şifa ukhrā, nāshifa.** ‘Boil a jointed kid in vinegar’: ‘Cut a kid into quarters, and scald in vinegar’.

‘boil it in vinegar’: ‘scald in water’. In both these passages, the verb is *yuslaq* ‘boil’, not *yusmat* ‘scald’.

**Maşūş.** ‘Take a suckling kid, scald it and cut it up into joints’: ‘Take a suckling kid and skin, cut into quarters’.

‘When it (viz. the celery leaf) stews, throw the kid in the pot’: ‘When the kid is juicy (Sc. after frying in the oil), place it in the saucepan’.



**Maqlūba.** ‘a thin (*laṭīf*) iron or copper pan’: ‘a fine iron or copper frying-pan’.

**Bazmāward.** ‘Take excellent pithy *samīd* bread and remove its crumb. Then stuff it well with that roast meat’ (*yuhshā min dhālika al-shiwā’ hashwan jayyidan*): ‘Take good pithy white bread, extract the pith, and with this stuff the roast well’. As shown by other medieval recipes, *bazmāward* was a sort of sandwich or canape, not roast meat stuffed with bread crumbs.

**Baid Maṣūṣ.** Arberry omitted the instruction ‘When they fry (*yutaḥjan*)’.

### Chapter VI

**Samak Mashwī.** The roasting spit is ‘of iron’ (*ḥadīd*), not ‘new’ (*jadīd*).

‘Cover its top (long) enough that it is known that it is done’: ‘Cover, and leave to cook well’.

**Māliḥ Nā‘im.** ‘make delicate slashes in it (the fish)’: ‘make small holes [in the fish]’. The Arabic is *yushaqqu fihi shuqūqan diqāqan*.

**Samak Maqlū bi-Khall wa-Rahshī.** ‘If you like, put a little finely pounded mustard in it, and it might be made with other (flavourings) than that’: ‘If desired, some fine-ground mustard may be added, but this is not necessary’. Arberry interpreted the ambiguous phrase *bi-ghair dhālika* as ‘without that’, but since mustard was explicitly introduced as an optional flavouring, I prefer to entertain the sense ‘with other than that’.

**Māliḥ bi-Laban.** ‘Take salted fish, wash it and cut it as we have described’: ‘Take salted fish, wash and clean as described’. I have no doubt that in this recipe *laban* is yogurt, rather than milk, as Arberry translated it.

**Maqlūbat al-Ṭarrīkh.** ‘pick their bones and spines clean – pick

them extremely well, as well as you can’: ‘bone, and scale with the greatest care’. The verb is the same in both phrases (*yunaqqā/tanqiya*), and it seems to refer to removing the meat (which is further processed in the next step), rather than the scales.

**Mufarraka.** ‘like *mufarraka*, which has been mentioned before’: ‘as in making *mufarraka* [recte *maqlūba*] as described above’. The difference between the two dishes is that *maqlūba* is an egg cake which is fried on both sides, *mufarraka* is a scramble which is stirred as it cooks. This dish does indeed brown like the *mufarraka* in Chapter V, not like the *maqlūba* previous.

### Chapter VII

**Lift Mukhallal Muḥallā.** ‘As for (the kind) that is not sweetened, cut them up’: ‘What is not dissolved may be cut up’. Chelebi changed al-Baghdādī’s *lam yuḥallā*, ‘not sweetened’, to the grammatically correct spelling *lam yuḥall(a)*, and Arberry read this as *lam yuḥall*, ‘not dissolved’.

‘As for smooth cucumbers, ridged cucumbers, onions and other (vegetables) which you want to pickle, put them in vinegar alone until they soften and mature’: ‘For sousing cucumber, capers, onion and the like, put into vinegar as required, leave until soft and tender’. The instruction distinguishes between two kinds of cucumber, *khiyār* and *quththā*”; Arberry read the last as *qubbār*, ‘capers’. He read *ḥasb* as *ḥasaba* ‘according to’ with an omitted object such as *al-ḥāja*; I take it as equivalent to *fa-ḥasb* ‘and no more, only’, meaning that these vegetables are pickled in vinegar alone, without spices and herbs.

**Bādhinjān bi-Laban.** Again I think *laban* must mean yogurt, rather than fresh milk.

‘Refine fresh sesame oil with a bit of cumin and coriander and throw it on it. Sprinkle a bit of mixed spices and nigella

(*shūnīz*) on it': 'Refine fresh sesame-oil, add a little cumin and coriander, and into this place the eggplant. Sprinkle with some *blattes de Bysance* and sesame'.

**Qar<sup>c</sup> bi-Laban.** 'Persian yogurt': 'Persian milk'.

**Silq bi-Laban.** 'Persian yogurt': 'Persian milk'.

'nigella': 'sesame'.

**Shīrāz bi-Buqūl.** '*shīrāz*': 'dried curds'.

'renneted yogurt (*al-laban al-mās*): 'coagulated milk'.

'sour yogurt': 'sour milk'.

**Kāmakh Rijāl.** 'Dry red rose petals': 'dried leaves of the red rose'.

**Zaitūn Mubakhkhar.** The recipe makes it clear that the meaning of *mubakhkhar* is literally 'smoked', not 'perfumed'.

'until their bitterness goes away': 'until the sourness passes off'.

'Then put them on a tray woven of sticks (*‘alā ṭabaq min ‘īdān mushabbak*): 'Put grated cinnamon on a plate'. Arberry clearly read *‘īdān* 'sticks' as sticks of cinnamon; the source of 'grated' is hard to see. Later he translates *al-ṭabaq al-mushabbak* as 'the reticulated plate'.

'Put that on it': 'then add to the cinnamon'.

**Milḥ Muṭayyab.** 'The salt might be coloured (*wa-qad yuṣbagh al-milḥ*): 'colour it'. Arberry missed the particle *qad* in this passage but noted it in the later instruction on colouring the salt with sumac or vermilion.

**Bāqillā bi-Khall:** *Bāquili bī-Khall.*

### Chapter VIII.

**Jūdhāb al-Khubz.** 'soak it in water or fresh milk until it sours [until it grows (matures); *Minhāj*]: 'soak in water or fresh milk until moist'. Both manuscripts of al-Baghdādī and the identical recipes that appear in *Kitāb Wasf* and the contemporary *Kitāb al-Wuṣla ilā al-Ḥabīb* say to soak the

bread until it sours (*ḥattā yakhtamir*). However, Chelebi preferred the marginal note from the *Minhāj*, *ḥattā yarbū*, which Arberry read as ‘until it is moist’, perhaps connecting it with the word *rubb*, ‘thickened fruit juice, pulp’.

**Jūdhāb al-Qatāyif.** ‘Take fried crepes stuffed with almonds and sugar’: ‘Take *qatāʾif* stuffed with almonds and sugar and fried’.

**Şifa ukhrā.** ‘stir it with a poker until the fat is released’: ‘stirring with a poker until the oil is resolved’.

**Şifa ukhrā.** ‘put a pound of toasted *samīd* flour on it’: ‘crumble into it a *raḥl* of white meal’.

‘stir it with the poker until it casts off its fat, and take it up’: ‘stirring with a poker, until the oil comes away and is thrown off’.

### Chapter IX

**Ḥalwā Yābisa.** Arberry says to ‘plant’ (*yudrab*, ‘beat’) the peg (or stake) in the sugar mass, but, as other recipes show, it was instead pounded into a wall for stretching the candy.

‘Some of it might be rolled (or kneaded)’: ‘Sometimes it is crumbled’.

**Şābūniyya.** ‘dissolve sugar, then take it from the *dist* and put it in a vessel. Then throw sesame oil (into the *dist*), and when it boils, throw some of the syrup on it’: ‘Dissolve sugar, then pour it out of the dish into a vessel, adding sesame-oil; when boiling, throw in some syrup’. Arberry has both sugar and sesame in the vessel (*ināʿ*), leaving the boiling unexplained.

**Makshūfa.** ‘so that it boils (*yaghli*) and boils up (*yafūr*)’: ‘and boil until fragrant’. Did Arberry mistake *yafūr* for *yafūḥ*?

**Lauzīnaj.** ‘roll it up like a belt’ (*yuṭwā kal-sair*): ‘fold round strip-wise’.

**Fālūdhaj.** ‘*ausāt*’: ‘middling pieces’.

**Mukaffan:** ‘*ausāt*’: ‘belts’.

**Barad.** ‘Take the necessary amount of sugar, dissolve it with rose-water’: ‘Take honey as required, and mix with rose-water’.

**Samak wa-Aqrās.** ‘dissolve an ounce of starch in rose-water’: ‘Mix an uqiya of starch with rose-water’.

### Chapter X

**Khushkanānaj.** In this and other pastry recipes, Arberry speculated that ‘gathering’ refers to impressing patterns on them with carved moulds, which is possible; but cf. *urnīn* below, where ‘gathering’ (*tujma*<sup>c</sup>) and ‘stamping’ (*tukhtam*) appear to be separate operations.

**Urnīn wa-Khubz al-Abāzīr.** ‘let there be a mould for them like a box’ (*kal-ḥuqq*): ‘using an appropriate mould’ (*kal-haqq*; ‘like what is due’). Both readings are possible.

‘four ounces of sesame oil and half a *rub*<sup>c</sup> of peeled sesame seed’: ‘four *ūqiya* of sesame-oil and an eighth of this quantity of shelled sesame’. *Rub*<sup>c</sup> is an ambiguous measure; it literally means ‘a quarter’, and it can refer to a quarter of a *dirham* (=  $\frac{3}{4}$  gram) or a quarter of any given measurement, but here I believe it means a quarter of a *qadaḥ*, or about one measuring cup.

NB: Although Arberry does not note it, this recipe calls for a European-type bread oven (*furn*) rather than the tandoor (*tannūr*) called for in other chapters.

**Aqrās Mukallala.** ‘Cover them with that dough’ (*yulbas bi-dhālika al-<sup>c</sup>ajīn*): ‘spread over that dough’.

**Ruṭab Mu<sup>c</sup>assal.** ‘until the weather is cold and it enters the Kānūns (December and January)’: ‘until the weather is cold and chafing-dishes are brought in’. Against Arberry’s interpretation, the text spells the verb in the active voice. *K. Waṣf* has a clearer instruction: ‘Use them only during the chilly season, and when the fresh date season is over’.

In this recipe Arberry left the puzzling word *gharīq/farīq* untranslated.

**Şifat ‘amal ruṭab fī ghair awānihi.** ‘large dried dates’: ‘poor quality dates’. Arberry read *qaşb*, ‘dry dates that crumble in the mouth’ as *quşāb*, ‘poor quality dates’.

‘spikenard’: ‘hyacinth’.

**Şifat ‘amal al-Kabūlā.** ‘moisten it with a little sesame oil, about an ounce’: ‘pour in an *ūqiya* of sesame oil, little by little’.